



APPROVED SUMMARIZED MINUTES

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

THURSDAY, JUNE 16, 2016

**COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Holley called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:01 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Paul Holley, Vice Chair
Gary Bretz, Commissioner
Barry Graham, Commissioner
Jyme Sue McLaren, Commissioner
Robert Stickles, Commissioner

ABSENT: Steven Olmsted, Chair
Steven Rosenberg, Commissioner

STAFF: Madeline Clemann, Transit Manager
Susan Conklu, Senior Transportation Planner

GUESTS: Ron Brooks, Valley Metro

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public wished to address the Commission.

4. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission – May 19, 2016
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – May 19, 2016

COMMISSIONER BRETZ MOVED TO APPROVE THE STUDY SESSION MINUTES OF MAY 19, 2016 AND THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF MAY 19, 2016 AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR OLMSTED AND COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG WERE ABSENT.

5. Non-ADA

Madeline Clemann, Transportation Planning and Transit Operations Manager, provided the presentation. Under Title 49 Subtitle A of the Federal Code of Regulations, the Federal Transportation Administration defines individuals as ADA paratransit eligible under the following conditions:

“Any individual with a disability who is unable as the result of a physical or mental impairment, including a vision impairment and without the assistance of another individual, except the operator of a wheelchair, lift or other boarding assistance device, to board, ride or disembark from any vehicle on the system which is readily accessible to and usable by individuals with disabilities.”

The Transportation Department conducts testing in order to certify individuals as being disabled in order to qualify for East Valley Dial-A-Ride service. For seniors who are not ADA certified and are age 65 years or older, other programs are available. Some seniors do not wish to be classified as ADA disabled and choose not to enter the certification process. These seniors may participate in the Cab Connection program whether or not they pursue ADA certification. Scottsdale operates two senior transportation programs.

- East Valley Dial-A-Ride
 - Originally created for those who are ADA certified.
 - An add-on program has been created for seniors.
 - Those age 65 or older can use the service.
 - Scottsdale, Tempe and Chandler pay for East Valley Dial-A-Ride senior services, however Mesa and Gilbert do not.
- Scottsdale Cab Connection
 - Those age 65 or older can use the service.
 - City run and financed program.
 - Other cities provide programs such as Ride Choice and Platinum Passes.
 - Ride Choice
 - Accepts seniors age 65 and older.
 - Seniors must prepay \$25 to \$30 to receive a total of \$100 of taxi service per month, using a rechargeable credit card type smart card. Prepayment is a challenge for low income seniors.
 - Cities pay the remaining portion for trip costs.
 - Users of the system average two to three trips per month.

- Users may not utilize more than \$100 in service per month, however they can bank unused funds.
- Participant cities include Chandler, Fountain Hills, Gilbert, Mesa and Tempe.
- Platinum Pass
 - Similar to a bus pass in appearance.
 - The pass pays for the fixed route bus fare.
 - Available to ADA certified individuals.
 - Busses are equipped to accommodate disabled riders.
 - Program funding no longer comes from the City budget and comes directly from Prop 400 regional sales tax funding.
- East Valley Dial-A-Ride Program
 - Accepts seniors age 65 and older.
 - An application is required.
 - No testing required.
 - Currently offers unlimited numbers of trips.
 - Trips are scheduled through a call center 365 days a year.
 - Total trips in Scottsdale in 2014/2015 were 14,478 with total East Valley trips approaching 50,000.
 - In March, 2016, 66 Scottsdale residents were approved for the program.
 - Approximately 36 individuals use the service every month.
 - Nineteen riders are also enrolled in Cab Connection.
 - Four individuals made trips longer than six miles.
 - The City costs for trips was \$11.69 to \$50.14.
 - There are different scheduling rules and fares for seniors versus ADA certified individuals, leading to confusion over which program to use when scheduling trips.
 - Senior participants schedule trips to achieve a lower fare than Cab Connection, which overloads the dispatch office.
 - Clients argue with drivers when asked to pay mileage charges on the senior program.
 - There is no cost containment for the City.
 - The base fare is \$4 per one-way trip with a 50 cent per mile additional charge for trips six to 15 miles and \$1 per mile for every mile 16 and over.
- Cab Connection
 - Accepts seniors age 65 and older.
 - Accepts ADA certified individuals.
 - An application is required.
 - Riders are provided 16 one-way trips per month.
 - Trips can be scheduled 24/7 by calling a cab company directly.
 - The City's maximum outlay per ride is \$10.
 - The rider pays 20 percent of the total amount up to \$10.
 - For amounts over \$10, the rider covers the entire cost.

After considering the problems, costs to the City and the lack of cost control, it is being recommended that the duplicative East Valley Dial-A-Ride senior program be eliminated. It is further recommended that the East Valley Dial-A-Ride senior riders be moved to the Cab Connection program. Benefits of this change include:

- Reduction of call center scheduling mistakes.
- Ends fare confusion.
- Some East Valley Dial-A-Ride seniors will be able to attain ADA certification and will continue to use East Valley Dial-A-Ride as an ADA certified user.

Cab Connection senior impacts include:

- Seniors using a Cab Connection voucher and keeping their trips at six miles or less will result in lower fares.
- As trip lengths increase fares will also increase.
- Nine East Valley Dial-A-Ride seniors currently make trips over six miles. Five are estimated to be ADA certifiable and are expected to continue to use East Valley Dial-A-Ride.
- Seniors will need to manage trip length to pay for a higher portion of the fare, which will continue to be monitored. Vouchers for medical trips may be issued in hardship cases.

City budget impacts:

- In terms of the City's budget, this will help to contain senior transit service costs.
- Eliminates an East Valley Dial-A-Ride annual cost of \$73,000, but will increase the annual Cab Connection budget by approximately \$32,000 for an estimated cost savings of \$41,000.
- Currently, the Cab Connection program costs approximately \$385,000 while the East Valley ADA certified Dial-A-Ride program costs approximately \$880,000 and the senior program totaling \$73,000 for a total of \$1.34 million.

Should the Transportation Commission approve the change, staff would provide City Council with an email notification next week of the intention in order to solicit comments. In July, the Platinum Pass program will be initiated. Also in July, a explanation letter and a Cab Connection application will be issued to the 66 East Valley Dial-A-Ride participants. Between July and September, the Cab Connection applications would be processed, with East Valley Dial-A-Ride continuing until October 1st, at which time the change would be implemented.

A Commissioner commented that a reduction of two programs to one would eliminate much confusion.

A Commissioner voiced appreciation for pursuing a more sustainable model.

A Commissioner stated that 16 vouchers for eight round trips in one month is not a significant amount for a traveler who might be volunteering or working regularly. Ms. Clemann noted that most users in the Cab Connection program do not use services for work. The number of vouchers was cut from 20 three to four years ago because seniors were not using them. Only one person in the last two years has asked for more vouchers. When the notice of change is mailed out, riders will be asked to contact the department if a hardship exists. If there are a number of hardships reported, a program will be developed to meet these needs.

A Commissioner asked how many people who are not seniors utilize non-ADA service. Ms. Clemann stated that a rider must be 65 or older. Ron Brooks, Manager of Accessible Services for Valley Metro, stated that individuals utilizing non-ADA Dial-A-Ride service

provided by East Valley Dial-A-Ride do include both seniors and others who are ADA certified who travel on a same day basis. The vast majority of customers who use non-ADA service are seniors. Non-seniors must become ADA certified in order to use services. If the City Council approves the proposed elimination of the non-ADA program through East Valley Dial-A-Ride, Valley Metro would inform customers who are taking same day trips and who are not seniors of the option to use Cab Connection. These customers could use East Valley Dial-A-Ride for advanced reservation ADA paratransit and can use Cab Connection as a resident of the City of Surprise for same day trips. This will not change their ability to travel. Metro Valley's data for East Valley Dial-A-Ride for non-ADA riders reveals that trips are short, averaging approximately five miles with low trip numbers. Furthermore, the data reveals that the average customer is taking fewer than ten trips per month on all programs.

A Commissioner suggested the addition of a component to the travel training program which would teach riders to effectively combine cab trips and transit methods. Ms. Clemann stated that this is included in the narrative training provided to seniors at the senior center.

In response to a question from a Commissioner, Mr. Brooks stated that non-ADA riders from Tempe and Chandler will be able to travel into Scottsdale. Each local jurisdiction is free to set their own rules for non-ADA service.

A Commissioner suggested public outreach to provide the opportunity for resident comments and suggestions. Upon discussion of notification methods, it was suggested to post details of the change at the senior center. A public information officer will be developing an outreach program.

There was discussion that this agenda item was posted for information and discussion only. Ms. Clemann stated that while a motion would not be proposed, the Commission was free to agree to a decision by consensus. There was a consensus of four (4) to one (1) for recommended the proposed change, with Commissioner Bretz dissenting. He noted that staff has changed its position over time. In the past, they were proponents of senior transportation. He expressed concern that a number of seniors will struggle to have adequate access.

Vice Chair Holley noted that the Commission has agreed by consensus and that the issue now goes to City Council for action. The Commission is not scheduled to meet again until August. Ms. Clemann added that with City Council's approval, the change will be implemented in October.

6. WAYFINDING SIGNAGE UPDATE

Susan Conklu, Senior Transportation Planner provided the presentation. Highlights included:

- Background
 - Wayfinding signage was included in the 2008 Transportation Master Plan in the bicycle element, which recommended wayfinding signage for paths and trails.
 - The project began in 2011.
 - In 2011 and 2012 interns explored low cost in-house installation options. As a result, test signs were installed in June, 2013 through October of 2013 from Shea to McKellips on Indian Bend Wash.

- Since 2012, staff has come before the Paths & Trails Committee, the Transportation Commission and the Parks & Recreation Commission to provide updates.
 - During this time, there was a transition from installing test signage to working with consultants to design custom looks.
 - The findings reflected a lack of a consistent system or hierarchy of signage, including inconsistency of symbols.
- New design concepts were presented last July and have since been refined.
 - Direction panels would be larger than the test signage.
 - Larger text with two-inch letters on 36- inch wide panels.
 - Signs along the canal will have a blue background.
 - Signs along paved paths will be green.
 - Signs along unpaved trails will be brown.
 - Sign samples were displayed and discussed.

A Commissioner stressed simplicity, such as the possibility of having the signs all be the same color. The differing pathways could be distinguished with trim patterns. Multiple sign colors have the potential to create confusion.

Another Commissioner opined that the differing colors assisted with distinguishing path categories more effectively. Vice Chair Holley suggested that the design was better left to the graphic designers.

- The prototypes were developed over the winter and have been displayed for comment since that time.
 - Signs were displayed at the Cycle the Arts Community Bike Ride Event.
 - The Paths & Trails Subcommittee reviewed the signs on May 3rd.
 - Two open houses were held at Chaparral Park in May.
 - The signs were reviewed by the Parks & Recreation Commission after the open house meetings.
 - Signs have been on display at the One Civic Atrium since April.
- Twenty written comments were received in addition to verbal comments received at meetings, with the majority of comments being positive. A common recommendation was to integrate technology, including a link reference to the City's online interactive map.
- Next steps.
 - Finalization of designs in approximately the next 30 days.
 - Finalize sign location designations.
 - Staff coordination of implementation and installation after the fiscal year starts in July.
 - Scheduling will depend on other bikeways projects, as the sign installation does not have its own CIP number.
 - The all-in highest cost estimate is approximately \$800,000, unless the number of signs changes dramatically in the next few weeks. Cost includes materials, fabrications, post, concrete pads, staff time and contingency. Complete installation could take two to four years.
 - After the first year, staff will request funding through the CIP budgeting process.

Highlights of the ensuing comments included:

- A Commissioner stated that the sign design was excellent, including the three colors included in the backdrop. The differing colors provides a differentiation between the types of paths and trail systems.
- A Commissioner concurred with the attractiveness and effectiveness of the three colors.
- In response to a Commissioner's question regarding comments from the Parks & Recreation Commission, Ms. Conklu reviewed a list of comments received.
 - Sign program is good for visitors.
 - Would like to integrate a web link for those using smartphones.
 - There are questions on funding.
 - Suggested clear direction on where equestrians are prohibited.
 - Positive comments were received on the access point signs and the logo.
- A Commissioner commented that it would be helpful for users to have a web link in order to use their phone GPS to navigate the map.
- A Commissioner stated that the signs are so attractive that there is the potential for theft or vandalism.
- A Commissioner commented that wealthy tourists come from countries outside the U.S. that use kilometers and suggested consideration for inclusion on the signs.
- A Commissioner suggested including "No urban camping" on the list of prohibitions.
- Ms. Conklu stated that in response to the City's last two applications to the League of American Bicyclists, the City has been encouraged to install wayfinding signage.
- A Commissioner commented that the blazer signs and their poles are too large.
- A Commissioner stressed importance of having the north directional cues always at the top of the sign.
- In response to a question from a Commissioner, Ms. Conklu confirmed that the \$800,000 cost is for signs from McKellips to Indian Bend Wash only.
- The Commissioner asked for a cost estimate on the total sign cost for the City. Ms. Clemann stated that the next step would be to acquire the total pricing after the value engineering processes and other steps necessary to determine an estimate. Ms. Conklu clarified that the scope thus far does not include mapping areas north of Indian Bend. These will be covered in the future as the program moves forward.
- A Commissioner recalled that the scope charged to JRC when it was hired was to look at the entire City from Carefree to McKellips. Ms. Conklu replied that the scope was changed by the time a contract was entered into, due to funding mechanisms. JRC may be hired to complete the entire scope of the City, depending on funding.
- Vice Chair Holley asked whether Indian Bend Wash was inclusive of Camelback Walk. Ms. Conklu replied that Indian Bend Wash informally includes several points on the main continuous wash, but that areas such as Shea, Camelback Walk, Upper Camelback Wash and WestWorld will have likely have detailed name designations. Vice Chair Holley suggested that the Indian Bend Wash designation stop at Shea. Ms. Conklu replied that Indian Bend Wash will likely end slightly before reaching the McCormick Ranch neighborhood.

7. OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAM STATUS

Ms. Clemann provided an update on freeway paving. Paving is complete southbound. There are two segments remaining northbound. Paving will not continue this weekend as an ambient temperature 110 degrees or less is required for paving. Striping will commence when paving is complete.

The Transportation Master Plan will be presented to City Council on July 5th with public comments invited at the meeting. City Council will then take action as to its approval.

The Arizona Canal Path from Chaparral to Indian Bend Wash is on hold, due to bird nesting.

8. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no public comments.

9. COMMISSION IDENTIFICATION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

A Commissioner stated that he has repeatedly asked for a presentation from Duet and Foothills Caring Corps. Ms. Clemann stated that she will pass this suggestion to Mr. Basha.

Vice Chair Holley noted that there will be no meeting in July. The meeting in August will take place at the Kiva.

A Commissioner requested an update on Hidden Hills. He also asked for a presentation on the totality of broken trails within the City and possibilities of filling the gaps and other remediation.

A Commissioner asked for an update on the Bike Share program.

A Commissioner asked for a discussion on Downtown sidewalks.

10. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to conduct, Vice Chair Holley adjourned the regular meeting at 7:46 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

***Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**